

CITY OF SOMERVILLE, MASSACHUSETTS

MAYOR'S OFFICE OF STRATEGIC PLANNING & COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT JOSEPH A. CURTATONE MAYOR

GEORGE J. PROAKIS *EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR*

PLANNING DIVISION
HISTORIC PRESERVATION

SARAH WHITE, MDS-HP
ZONING PLANNER & PRESERVATION PLANNER

September 15, 2020 Case: HPC.ALT 2020.20 Site: 15 Campbell Park

ALTERATION OF A LOCAL HISTORIC DISTRICT PROPERTY STAFF REPORT

Site: 15 Campbell Park

Applicant Name: Contempo Builders

Owner Name: Victor Del Porto

<u>Petition:</u> Construct left elevation dormer; rebuild front porch replace all windows*

*This is a correction. The front porch will be repaired/maintained in-kind. All windows are proposed for replacement.

HPC Hearing Date: September 15, 2020



I. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

1. Subject Property: See the attached Form B for historic and architectural information on this LHD property.



Date: September 15, 2020 Case #: HPC.ALT 2020.27 Site: 15 Campbell Park

2. Proposal: The Applicant proposes constructing a left elevation shed dormer with two full-sized, 2x2 windows. The dormer will be set at least one foot below the ridge of the roof. The existing eave line will be retained at the termination point of the new dormer.

The Applicant also proposes replacing all of the windows on the property (details attached).

II. FINDINGS

The HPC must make findings based on the Historic District Ordinance (HDO) in compliance with M.G.L. Chapter 40C, and associated Design Guidelines. The portion of the regulations that is applicable to the proposed alterations is discussed below.

A. CONSTRUCT LEFT ELEVATION DORMER

Section B. Roofs, item 5

New dormers will be permitted if they are related to the forms, proportions, size and arrangement of existing windows, and constructed in matching materials and colors. If possible, new dormers should be confined to the rear of the house.

Preservation Planning Assessment

The proposed dormer will be constructed of the same materials and colors as the body and trim of the main portion of the structure. With a gable-fronted structure, it is not possible to confine the dormer to the rear of the house. The proposed dormer will be set back from the downward gable slope by about three (3) feet \pm -.

The structures immediately to the right and left of 15 Campbell Park are also LHDs and present dormers, each of different slope, pitch, and width. To the left, 11 Campbell Park presents a right elevation dormer and to the right, 13 Campbell Park presents a left elevation dormer.



В.

Date: September 15, 2020 Case #: HPC.ALT 2020.27 Site: 15 Campbell Park

C. Windows and Doors

- 1. Retain original and later important door and window openings where they exist. Do not enlarge or reduce door and window openings for the purpose of fitting stock window sash or doors, or air conditioners.
- 2. Whenever possible, repair and retain original or later important window elements such as sash, lintels, sill, architraves, glass, shutters and other decorative elements and hardware. When replacement of materials or elements is necessary, it should be based on physical or documentary evidence. If aluminum windows must be installed, select a baked finish that matches as closely as possible the color of the existing trim. Investigate weather-stripping and storm windows with a baked enamel finish as an alternative to the replacement of historic sash. Preservation Planning Assessment

Based on images of the exterior of the building, it appears that the 2x2 windows are original to the structure and currently sporting exterior storms. Online images from the real estate listing for this property allow a closer inspection of these windows from the interior and confirm this hypothesis. The existing 2x2 windows are wood and likely original to the structure and are not retrofitted replacements: the wood window tracts are exposed and evidence of the former ropeand-weight system can be seen at the top of one of the images below.

Design Guidelines state that original windows should be retained where they exist, including sash, sill, glass, and other decorative elements. Exterior storms, interior storms, insulating and weather-stripping of windows are not regulated by the Commission. Window restoration would be considered maintenance and repair in-kind.



Above: Note original tracks and original wood sash and muntins.

Page 4 of 5

Date: September 15, 2020 Case #: HPC.ALT 2020.27 Site: 15 Campbell Park



Left: Note original track, evidence of rope and weight system, wood sash, raised wood muntins, true divided lites.

HPC Determination:

- The HPC must determine if the proposed project satisfies the applicable regulations for:
 - o Dormers
 - Windows
- The HPC must structure their motion to include their own specific findings on the proposed project.

Date: September 15, 2020 Case #: HPC.ALT 2020.27 Site: 15 Campbell Park

III. RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS

Should the HPC decide to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness (CA), Preservation Planning suggests that the following conditions be added to any approvals:

Depending on their determinations, the HPC may need to alter this list to conform to the decisions made.

- 1. All relevant permits shall be obtained from the Inspectional Services Department (ISD) prior to the start of work.
- 2. The applicant shall upload their Certificate of Appropriateness (CA) to ISD's permitting system.
- 3. Any changes made to this project shall be submitted in the form of a new application with accompanying documentation to Preservation Planning for review and approval by the HPC.
- 4. The dormer shall be skinned in cedar clapboards and painted to match the body of the main portion of the structure.
- 5. Trim on dormer shall be constructed of a hardwood (NO PINE), and be painted to match the trim details on the main structure.
- 6. The windows on the dormer shall be all wood, 2x2, true divided lite. Muntin profile shall match that of the original windows on the house as closely as possible. Any coatings on the windows shall not produce a warped or colored reflection.
- 7. Original windows on the front, left, and right elevations shall be retained and restored. Exterior or interior storms shall be used. The existing windows shall be stripped, re-glazed, the openings insulated and weather-stripped to make them energy efficient and airtight.
- 8. Work shall commence within one year of the date of approval for this Certificate. If work does not commence within one year, this Certificate shall expire. The applicant must then submit an application to the HPC requesting the re-issuance of the Certificate.
- 9. The Applicant shall contact Preservation Planning at historic@somervillema.gov a minimum of 15 business days prior to final ISD sign-off so that Preservation Planning or their designee can confirm that the project was completed according to HPC approvals.

Massachusetts Cultural Resource Information System

Scanned Record Cover Page

Inventory No: SMV.183

Historic Name: Holbrook, Julia A. House

Common Name:

Address: 15 Campbell Pk

City/Town: Somerville

Village/Neighborhood: Davis Square

Local No:

Year Constructed: 1892

Architect(s):

Architectural Style(s): Queen Anne

Use(s): Single Family Dwelling House

Significance: Architecture

Area(s): SMV.N: Campbell Park - Meacham Road Historic District

Designation(s): Local Historic District (10/31/1989)

Building Materials(s):

Roof: Asphalt Shingle

Wall: Wood; Wood Clapboard; Wood Shingle

The Massachusetts Historical Commission (MHC) has converted this paper record to digital format as part of ongoing projects to scan records of the Inventory of Historic Assets of the Commonwealth and National Register of Historic Places nominations for Massachusetts. Efforts are ongoing and not all inventory or National Register records related to this resource may be available in digital format at this time.

The MACRIS database and scanned files are highly dynamic; new information is added daily and both database records and related scanned files may be updated as new information is incorporated into MHC files. Users should note that there may be a considerable lag time between the receipt of new or updated records by MHC and the appearance of related information in MACRIS. Users should also note that not all source materials for the MACRIS database are made available as scanned images. Users may consult the records, files and maps available in MHC's public research area at its offices at the State Archives Building, 220 Morrissey Boulevard, Boston, open M-F, 9-5.

Users of this digital material acknowledge that they have read and understood the MACRIS Information and Disclaimer (http://mhc-macris.net/macrisdisclaimer.htm)

Data available via the MACRIS web interface, and associated scanned files are for information purposes only. THE ACT OF CHECKING THIS DATABASE AND ASSOCIATED SCANNED FILES DOES NOT SUBSTITUTE FOR COMPLIANCE WITH APPLICABLE LOCAL, STATE OR FEDERAL LAWS AND REGULATIONS. IF YOU ARE REPRESENTING A DEVELOPER AND/OR A PROPOSED PROJECT THAT WILL REQUIRE A PERMIT, LICENSE OR FUNDING FROM ANY STATE OR FEDERAL AGENCY YOU MUST SUBMIT A PROJECT NOTIFICATION FORM TO MHC FOR MHC'S REVIEW AND COMMENT. You can obtain a copy of a PNF through the MHC web site (www.sec.state.ma.us/mhc) under the subject heading "MHC Forms."

Commonwealth of Massachusetts
Massachusetts Historical Commission
220 Morrissey Boulevard, Boston, Massachusetts 02125
www.sec.state.ma.us/mhc

This file was accessed on: Saturday, September 12, 2020 at 2:00: PM



MASSACHUSETTS HISTORICAL COMMISSION 80 BOYLSTON STREET ROSTON MA 02116

LHO- 10/3/189 00 PL DAVIS SQ USIS- LEX

AREA Davis 183 Square

FORM NO.

50510119				-
13.83				1
				s .
	. / = }			·ic
				Pro
				Or:
				PT
ă ·		T E	10-	_
		Aller V		
THE STATE OF			Ar	chitect

Sketch Map: Draw map showing property's location in relation to nearest cross streets and/or geographical features. Indicate all buildings between inventoried property and nearest intersection(s). Indicate north

O III	KEP EKENCE		CONTRACTOR OF	
uses	QUADRANGLE	13 77 0	Igalficant to	1. 7
	TOWN REGIST			

SOMERVILLE

15 Campbell Park

Name Julia A. Holbrook

esent residential

iginal residential

ION

1892

deeds / directories

Oueen Anne

Exterior Wall	Fabric _	clapboard	
Outbuildings	14 12-12-12-12-12-12-12-12-12-12-12-12-12-1		

Major Alterations (with dates)

Condition fair-good

Moved _____ Date ___

Acreage 2474 sq. ft.

Setting North side of well establis

late 19th century residential

sub-division of gable-end dwellings

with varying architectural detail

Recorded by Gretchen G. Schuler

Organization Somerville Historic

Preservation Commission Date March, 1988

NATIONAL REGISTER CRITERIA STATEMENT (if applicable)

The property is significant for :

- A its representation of a late 19th century dwelling in a subdivision, which represent the suburbanization of the Davis Square area of Somerville.
 - C its architectural style and size as a part of a working and middle class subdivision with varying architectural elaboration representing varying tastes.

ARCHITECTURAL SIGNIFICANCE Describe important architectural features and evaluate in terms of other buildings within the community.

The two and one-half story, gable-end dwelling is representative in size, scale and plan of other dwellings on Campbell park. Architectural elaboration offers variety and interest to the streetscape. The gable end with wide returns is decorated with butt shingles as is part of the polygonal corner tower. There is also a dentil cornice on the gable end and tower. There are 4 pediments around the sides of the tower roof which is topped by a finial and later weather vane. The shed roof porch has been altered slightly with simple replacement balusters.

HISTORICAL SIGNIFICANCE Explain the role owners played in local or state history and how the building relates to the development of the community.

The property is one of many houses in the immediate area that was built in the 1890s when the subdivision was created. The land of Campbell Park was owned by Charles H. Saunders and Henry R. Glover in the 1870s and 1880s. By 1891 Henry F. Campbell of Belmont had purchased all the lots of Campbell Park. This property changed ownership several times in the early 1890s, all of whom appear to be investors. In 1892 Julia A. Holbrook of Boston purchased the property and building from Charles W. Wells. Holbrook owned the house until 1894 when she sold to Margaret Stevens of East Boston.

Much of the Davis Square area became the homes of railroad and streetcar commuters and is evidence of the suburban building boom of the late 19th century. Streetcar service along near by Massachusetts Avenue to Porter Square and to Davis Square provided easy access to Boston and Cambridge for employment. Directories indicate that renters or boarders lived at #15 Campbell including William R. Freethy, an adjuster and William J. Freethy, architect.

BIBLIOGRAPHY and/or REFERENCES

- 1. Atlas of Middlesex County, Somerville: 1895 ("Margaret Stevens").
 - 2. Directories: 1890s.
- 3. Registry of Deeds, Middlesex County: Book 2114, Page 81; Book 2319, Page 140.